

1 THE HONORABLE RONALD B. LEIGHTON
2 THE HONORABLE THERESA L. FRICKE
3
4
5
6
7

8 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
9 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
10 AT TACOMA

11 ALLSTATE INSURANCE COMPANY,
12 ALLSTATE PROPERTY & CASUALTY
13 INSURANCE COMPANY, ALLSTATE
14 INDEMNITY COMPANY, and ALLSTATE
15 FIRE & CASUALTY INSURANCE
16 COMPANY,

17 Plaintiffs,

18 v.
19 TACOMA THERAPY, INC., TACOMA
20 REHABILITATION THERAPY, INC., P.S.,
21 ANDREW JACOBS, MELANIE JACOBS,
22 NANDY, INC., NATHAN LEMINGS and
23 JANE DOE LEMINGS, husband and wife, and
24 the marital property thereof, THE LAW OFFICE
25 OF MCLAUGHLIN & ASSOCIATES, INC.,
DOES 1-100, and ROES 101-200.

26 Defendants.

NO. 3:18-mc-05022 RBL-TLF

PLATINUM COLLISION CENTER LLC
AND TAUSHA MCKERNAN'S FRCP 72(a)
OBJECTIONS TO MAGISTRATE FRICKE'S
APRIL 1, 2019 ORDER ON PLAINTIFFS'
MOTION TO COMPEL POSTJUDGMENT
DISCOVERY AND FOR AN ORDER
AUTHORIZING EXAMINATION OF
TAUSHA MCKERNAN

**NOTED FOR HEARING: APRIL 26, 2019
ORAL ARGUMENT REQUESTED**

27 COMES NOW Platinum Collision Center, LLC and its sole member, Tausha McKernan,
28 (collectively referred to throughout as "Platinum"),¹ by and through their attorneys of record, Stuart
29 C. Morgan and Grady R. Heins of Ledger Square Law, P.S., and hereby respectfully submit these

30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66
67
68
69
70
71
72
73
74
75
76
77
78
79
80
81
82
83
84
85
86
87
88
89
90
91
92
93
94
95
96
97
98
99
100
101
102
103
104
105
106
107
108
109
110
111
112
113
114
115
116
117
118
119
120
121
122
123
124
125
126
127
128
129
130
131
132
133
134
135
136
137
138
139
140
141
142
143
144
145
146
147
148
149
150
151
152
153
154
155
156
157
158
159
160
161
162
163
164
165
166
167
168
169
170
171
172
173
174
175
176
177
178
179
180
181
182
183
184
185
186
187
188
189
190
191
192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261
262
263
264
265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302
303
304
305
306
307
308
309
310
311
312
313
314
315
316
317
318
319
320
321
322
323
324
325
326
327
328
329
330
331
332
333
334
335
336
337
338
339
340
341
342
343
344
345
346
347
348
349
350
351
352
353
354
355
356
357
358
359
360
361
362
363
364
365
366
367
368
369
370
371
372
373
374
375
376
377
378
379
380
381
382
383
384
385
386
387
388
389
390
391
392
393
394
395
396
397
398
399
400
401
402
403
404
405
406
407
408
409
410
411
412
413
414
415
416
417
418
419
420
421
422
423
424
425
426
427
428
429
430
431
432
433
434
435
436
437
438
439
440
441
442
443
444
445
446
447
448
449
450
451
452
453
454
455
456
457
458
459
460
461
462
463
464
465
466
467
468
469
470
471
472
473
474
475
476
477
478
479
480
481
482
483
484
485
486
487
488
489
490
491
492
493
494
495
496
497
498
499
500
501
502
503
504
505
506
507
508
509
510
511
512
513
514
515
516
517
518
519
520
521
522
523
524
525
526
527
528
529
530
531
532
533
534
535
536
537
538
539
540
541
542
543
544
545
546
547
548
549
550
551
552
553
554
555
556
557
558
559
5510
5511
5512
5513
5514
5515
5516
5517
5518
5519
5520
5521
5522
5523
5524
5525
5526
5527
5528
5529
55210
55211
55212
55213
55214
55215
55216
55217
55218
55219
55220
55221
55222
55223
55224
55225
55226
55227
55228
55229
55230
55231
55232
55233
55234
55235
55236
55237
55238
55239
55240
55241
55242
55243
55244
55245
55246
55247
55248
55249
55250
55251
55252
55253
55254
55255
55256
55257
55258
55259
55260
55261
55262
55263
55264
55265
55266
55267
55268
55269
55270
55271
55272
55273
55274
55275
55276
55277
55278
55279
55280
55281
55282
55283
55284
55285
55286
55287
55288
55289
55290
55291
55292
55293
55294
55295
55296
55297
55298
55299
552100
552101
552102
552103
552104
552105
552106
552107
552108
552109
552110
552111
552112
552113
552114
552115
552116
552117
552118
552119
552120
552121
552122
552123
552124
552125
552126
552127
552128
552129
552130
552131
552132
552133
552134
552135
552136
552137
552138
552139
552140
552141
552142
552143
552144
552145
552146
552147
552148
552149
552150
552151
552152
552153
552154
552155
552156
552157
552158
552159
552160
552161
552162
552163
552164
552165
552166
552167
552168
552169
552170
552171
552172
552173
552174
552175
552176
552177
552178
552179
552180
552181
552182
552183
552184
552185
552186
552187
552188
552189
552190
552191
552192
552193
552194
552195
552196
552197
552198
552199
552200
552201
552202
552203
552204
552205
552206
552207
552208
552209
552210
552211
552212
552213
552214
552215
552216
552217
552218
552219
552220
552221
552222
552223
552224
552225
552226
552227
552228
552229
5522210
5522211
5522212
5522213
5522214
5522215
5522216
5522217
5522218
5522219
5522220
5522221
5522222
5522223
5522224
5522225
5522226
5522227
5522228
5522229
55222210
55222211
55222212
55222213
55222214
55222215
55222216
55222217
55222218
55222219
55222220
55222221
55222222
55222223
55222224
55222225
55222226
55222227
55222228
55222229
552222210
552222211
552222212
552222213
552222214
552222215
552222216
552222217
552222218
552222219
552222220
552222221
552222222
552222223
552222224
552222225
552222226
552222227
552222228
552222229
5522222210
5522222211
5522222212
5522222213
5522222214
5522222215
5522222216
5522222217
5522222218
5522222219
5522222220
5522222221
5522222222
5522222223
5522222224
5522222225
5522222226
5522222227
5522222228
5522222229
55222222210
55222222211
55222222212
55222222213
55222222214
55222222215
55222222216
55222222217
55222222218
55222222219
55222222220
55222222221
55222222222
55222222223
55222222224
55222222225
55222222226
55222222227
55222222228
55222222229
552222222210
552222222211
552222222212
552222222213
552222222214
552222222215
552222222216
552222222217
552222222218
552222222219
552222222220
552222222221
552222222222
552222222223
552222222224
552222222225
552222222226
552222222227
552222222228
552222222229
5522222222210
5522222222211
5522222222212
5522222222213
5522222222214
5522222222215
5522222222216
5522222222217
5522222222218
5522222222219
5522222222220
5522222222221
5522222222222
5522222222223
5522222222224
5522222222225
5522222222226
5522222222227
5522222222228
5522222222229
55222222222210
55222222222211
55222222222212
55222222222213
55222222222214
55222222222215
55222222222216
55222222222217
55222222222218
55222222222219
55222222222220
55222222222221
55222222222222
55222222222223
55222222222224
55222222222225
55222222222226
55222222222227
55222222222228
55222222222229
552222222222210
552222222222211
552222222222212
552222222222213
552222222222214
552222222222215
552222222222216
552222222222217
552222222222218
552222222222219
552222222222220
552222222222221
552222222222222
552222222222223
552222222222224
552222222222225
552222222222226
552222222222227
552222222222228
552222222222229
5522222222222210
5522222222222211
5522222222222212
5522222222222213
5522222222222214
5522222222222215
5522222222222216
5522222222222217
5522222222222218
5522222222222219
5522222222222220
5522222222222221
5522222222222222
5522222222222223
5522222222222224
5522222222222225
5522222222222226
5522222222222227
5522222222222228
5522222222222229
55222222222222210
55222222222222211
55222222222222212
55222222222222213
55222222222222214
55222222222222215
55222222222222216
55222222222222217
55222222222222218
55222222222222219
55222222222222220
55222222222222221
55222222222222222
55222222222222223
55222222222222224
55222222222222225
55222222222222226
55222222222222227
55222222222222228
55222222222222229
552222222222222210
552222222222222211
552222222222222212
552222222222222213
552222222222222214
552222222222222215
552222222222222216
552222222222222217
552222222222222218
552222222222222219
552222222222222220
552222222222222221
552222222222222222
552222222222222223
552222222222222224
552222222222222225
552222222222222226
552222222222222227
552222222222222228
552222222222222229
5522222222222222210
5522222222222222211
5522222222222222212
5522222222222222213
5522222222222222214
5522222222222222215
5522222222222222216
5522222222222222217
5522222222222222218
5522222222222222219
5522222222222222220
5522222222222222221
5522222222222222222
5522222222222222223
5522222222222222224
5522222222222222225
5522222222222222226
5522222222222222227
5522222222222222228
5522222222222222229
55222222222222222210
55222222222222222211
55222222222222222212
55222222222222222213
55222222222222222214
55222222222222222215
55222222222222222216
55222222222222222217
55222222222222222218
55222222222222222219
55222222222222222220
55222222222222222221
55222222222222222222
55222222222222222223
55222222222222222224
55222222222222222225
55222222222222222226
55222222222222222227
55222222222222222228
55222222222222222229
552222222222222222210
552222222222222222211
552222222222222222212
552222222222222222213
552222222222222222214
552222222222222222215
552222222222222222216
552222222222222222217
552222222222222222218
552222222222222222219
552222222222222222220
552222222222222222221
552222222222222222222
552222222222222222223
552222222222222222224
552222222222222222225
552222222222222222226
552222222222222222227
552222222222222222228
552222222222222222229
5522222222222222222210
5522222222222222222211
5522222222222222222212
5522222222222222222213
5522222222222222222214
5522222222222222222215
5522222222222222222216
5522222222222222222217
5522222222222222222218
5522222222222222222219
5522222222222222222220
5522222222222222222221
5522222222222222222222
5522222222222222222223
5522222222222222222224
5522222222222222222225
5522222222222222222226
5522222222222222222227
5522222222222222222228
5522222222222222222229
55222222222222222222210
55222222222222222222211
55222222222222222222212
55222222222222222222213
55222222222222222222214
55222222222222222222215
55222222222222222222216
55222222222222222222217
55222222222222222222218
55222222222222222222219
55222222222222222222220
55222222222222222222221
55222222222222222222222
55222222222222222222223
55222222222222222222224
55222222222222222222225
55222222222222222222226
55222222222222222222227
55222222222222222222228
55222222222222222222229
552222222222222222222210
552222222222222222222211
552222222222222222222212
552222222222222222222213
552222222222222222222214
552222222222222222222215
552222222222222222222216
552222222222222222222217
552222222222222222222218
552222222222222222222219
552222222222222222222220
5522

1 objections to Magistrate Fricke's April 1, 2019 *Order on Plaintiffs' Motion to Compel Postjudgment*
 2 *Discovery and for an Order Authorizing Examination of Tausha McKernan* (hereinafter "Magistrate
 3 Fricke's April 1, 2019 Order") pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 72(a).²

4 Platinum further respectfully requests that the District Court modify and/or set aside
 5 Magistrate Fricke's April 1, 2019 Order pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 72(a) as follows:

- 6 1. That the District Court retain jurisdiction of this phase of the case;
- 7 2. That the District Court hold that Platinum may bring a motion for protective order
 8 regarding the subpoena Plaintiffs issued to Platinum for the following reasons:

9 (a) The subpoena is unduly burdensome because it contains no time limitation as
 10 to the scope and expanse of the documents requested, seemingly requiring, for example, every email
 11 and text message ever exchanged between cousins Andrew Jacobs and Tausha McKernan;

12 (b) Although Magistrate Fricke's January 10, 2019 Order authorized Plaintiffs to
 13 conduct third party discovery to Platinum, Plaintiffs' subpoena contained a much larger definition of
 14 the term "YOU" to include not just Platinum, but its employees, attorneys, agents, consultants,
 15 representatives, and "anyone else acting or who has acted for or on its behalf" as those who must
 16 produce documents;

17 (c) The subpoena is over burdensome because it requires hundreds of hours of
 18 work as Platinum would have to first obtain the records and then sift through the same to determine
 19 the following responsive documents. For example, in order to produce all checks which Mr. Jacobs
 20 may have initialed pursuant to limited powers of attorney provided by Platinum's clients to
 21 Platinum, Platinum would need to see every check ever deposited in order to make that
 22 determination. Additionally, Platinum would have to review every financial transaction in its
 23 transaction history in order to determine: (a) the number of transactions over \$500 and; (b) then
 24 determine whether or not the transaction was made to Mr. Jacobs. This is in spite of the fact that

26 ² Dkt. 19.

between the time Plaintiffs obtained judgment against Mr. Jacobs and the time of his termination by Platinum, Plaintiffs *never* issued a writ of garnishment to Platinum for funds owed to Mr. Jacobs;

(d) The records demanded would require Platinum to obtain all documents regarding any phone owned by Platinum, any phone owned by one of its employees, any phone owned by any of its attorneys, agents, consultants, representatives, and anyone else acting or who has acted for or on its behalf and then from those phones retrieve all “monthly statements, call logs and message logs.” An undertaking like that would require months and months and would obviously incorporate objections by the individuals noted to the information. Platinum was given less than 10 days by Magistrate Fricke’s April 1, 2019 Order; and

(e) The subpoena demands documents that contain sensitive and confidential information regarding Platinum's employees and Platinum's finances. Given that Allstate currently does business with Platinum by negotiating the costs of repairs of vehicles to be paid by Allstate, Allstate could use Platinum's sensitive and confidential financial information to Platinum's disadvantage. Said documents could also force Platinum to divulge information about its own clients and their insurers which Allstate could use to its competitive advantage with no protections for Platinum or the other insurers.

3. That the District Court appoint a Discovery Master at Plaintiffs' cost to handle the third party discovery issues. At no time during Mr. Jacobs' employ did Platinum ever issue a writ of garnishment to Platinum and the records of Platinum show that only Tausha McKernan has ever been the only member of Platinum.

4. That the District Court enter an order barring the deposition of Tausha McKernan until such time as Plaintiffs properly issue a subpoena for Ms. McKernan's deposition that also gives Ms. McKernan the ability to raise her objections regarding the same. Although authorized by Magistrate Fricke to issue discovery, Plaintiffs never issued a subpoena for an oral deposition to Ms. McKernan, depriving the Court of jurisdiction over her. In the alternative, if the Court upholds

1 Magistrate Fricke's April 1, 2019 Order requiring the deposition of Ms. McKernan, that said
 2 deposition take place at a date and time in May 2019 and in the conference room of counsel for
 3 Platinum.

4 5. That if the Court does not enter an Order authorizing Platinum to bring a Motion for
 5 Protective Order regarding Plaintiffs' subpoena, that the Court change Magistrate Fricke's April 1,
 6 2019 Order to set a new deadline for compliance with the subpoena to a date approximately 90 days
 7 out from the date of these objections and that the Court set such date as a review date in case
 8 Platinum is unable to assemble all the documents ordered by the Court in that 90 days.

9 **II. STATEMENT OF APPLICABLE FACTS**

10 Counsel for Platinum appeared in this matter on April 4, 2019.³

11 **A. Platinum Incorporates**

12 On approximately March 3, 2016, Platinum filed its Certificate of Formation of Platinum
 13 Collision Center, LLC d/b/a Ace Autobody & Collision Center.⁴ Platinum was formed as a limited
 14 liability company pursuant to chapter 23.15 RCW which authorizes the formation of limited liability
 15 companies. Ms. McKernan is the only Member of Platinum.⁵ The only way to acquire a limited
 16 liability company interest is to be admitted as a member of the limited liability company.⁶ No one
 17 other than Ms. McKernan has ever been admitted as a member of Platinum.⁷ Platinum has filed all
 18 appropriate reports with the State of Washington to maintain its status as a limited liability company.

19 **B. The underlying proceedings**

20 Platinum does not dispute that at some point Plaintiffs obtained a judgment against
 21 Mr. Jacobs. However, on April 3, 2019, Platinum terminated the employment of Mr. Jacobs. *Decl.*
 22 *of S. Morgan in Support of Platinum's Objections, Exhibit A* (counsel's letter countersigned by

23
 24 ³ Dkt. 20, 22.

25 ⁴ Dkt. 11-14.

26 ⁵ RCW 23.15.006(10) defines the term "member" as, "a person who has been admitted to a limited liability company as a member as provided in RCW 25.15.116 and who has not been disassociated from the limited liability company.

⁶ RCW 25.15.116(1).

⁷ Dkt. 15.

1 Mr. Jacobs). At no time between the entry of Plaintiffs' judgment against Mr. Jacobs and
 2 Mr. Jacobs' termination on April 3, 2019, did Plaintiffs ever issue a writ of garnishment to Platinum
 3 seeking to collect on its judgment against Mr. Jacobs. No court ever issued a temporary restraining
 4 order or preliminary or permanent injunction against Platinum from compensating Mr. Jacobs for
 5 services rendered to Platinum by him. In March 2019, Ms. McKernan, the admitted sole member of
 6 Platinum filed a Declaration with the Court stating, in relevant part, “[i]f Allstate Insurance would
 7 like to garnish his [Mr. Jacobs'] pay, then I would accept garnishment paperwork as well.”⁸ Even
 8 after blatantly offering Allstate the suggestion of a writ of garnishment, Allstate did nothing to
 9 pursue the same.

10 Instead, Allstate, a sophisticated litigant, armed with unlimited resources to pursue
 11 Mr. Jacobs proceeded on a theory unsupported by any case law or statute that Mr. Jacobs is the
 12 owner of Platinum. Plaintiffs then embarked on a mission to force evidence to support its theories;
 13 theories that are unsupported by any citation to court rule, statute, or case law.

14 C. **Without notice to Platinum, Plaintiffs obtained an Order authorizing them to issue a**
 15 **subpoena and forcing Platinum to answer the subpoena. Said Order was ultimately**
 16 **vacated by the District Court.**

17 In October 29, 2018, Plaintiffs filed their Motion for FRCP 69 Postjudgment Discovery.⁹ It
 18 was noted for hearing the same day it was filed and sought authorization for Plaintiffs to issue a
 19 subpoena for documents to Platinum and an order requiring Platinum to provide documents
 20 responsive to that subpoena.¹⁰ Plaintiffs' counsel submitted an October 19, 2018 declaration
 21 wherein he testified, under penalty of perjury, that Mr. Jacobs “is believed to . . . own, operate,
 22 control . . . Platinum Collision Center [.]”¹¹ No facts or documents set forth in the Declaration

23
 24
 25
 26

⁸ Dkt. 15.

⁹ Dkt. 1.

¹⁰ *Id.*

¹¹ Dkt. 2.

1 supporting that testimony. No testimony was set forth as to who believed Mr. Jacobs owned or
 2 controlled Platinum or why said person believed that.¹²

3 Plaintiffs' counsel has further testified in this matter that prior to "preparing to issue the
 4 judgment debtor discovery in this matter, my office has performed a number of investigatory
 5 functions related to Mr. Jacobs, Ms. McKernan and Ace Autobody."¹³

6 However, as part of its motion practice, Plaintiffs did not disclose to the Court that the
 7 Secretary of State of Washington's website shows that Platinum is a single member LLC and that
 8 Mr. Jacobs is not listed as a member of the LLC or a governor of the LLC in any fashion.

9 On November 5, 2018, the Court entered an Order on Plaintiffs' Motion. As applied to
 10 Platinum, the Order provided, "Platinum Collision Center, LLC d/b/a Ace Auto Body Collision, will
 11 provide documents in response to the Subpoena to Produce Documents described in Exhibit E to the
 12 Declaration of Mark Melter within 21 days of service."¹⁴ The no-notice motion and Order
 13 eliminated any opportunity for Platinum to preserve any of its objections or rights against the
 14 subpoena.

15 The Court file then indicates that, regardless, Platinum made attempts to exercise objections
 16 to the subpoena on or about December 31, 2018.¹⁵

17 On January 7, 2019, unbeknownst to Platinum, the District Court entered an Order in Case
 18 No. 18-5022 which vacated Magistrate Fricke's November 5, 2018 Order.¹⁶ The District Court's
 19 January 7, 2019 Order also held that "any order Judge Fricke enters on it will be subject to review
 20 under Fed. R. Civ. P. 72."¹⁷

21
 22
 23 ¹² Whether or not Mr. Jacobs "operated" Platinum is irrelevant. The undisputed facts show that Mr. Jacobs was
 24 employed by Platinum as an independent contractor and has been terminated. Plaintiffs never defined what they meant
 25 by "operated" or "controlled."
 26 ¹³ Dkt. 11.
¹⁴ Dkt. 3.
¹⁵ Dkt. 11-5 (see language set forth in subpoena regarding Fed. R. Civ. P. 45(d)(2)(B)).
¹⁶ Dkt. 4.
¹⁷ *Id.* (emphasis added).

1 Three days later though, on January 10, 2019, again with no notice to Platinum, Magistrate
 2 Fricke entered another Order.¹⁸

3 Magistrate Fricke's January 10, 2019 Order stated in paragraph 1, "The discovery
 4 contemplated by FRCP 69(a) is a distinct phase of litigation, *focused narrowly* on enforcing the
 5 judgment by supplemental proceedings."¹⁹ As it related to Platinum, Magistrate Fricke's order
 6 holds, "The Court grants plaintiffs' motion to conduct third party discovery concerning PLATINUM
 7 COLLISION CENTER, LLC, and d/b/a ACE AUTOBODY & COLLISION."²⁰ However,
 8 Magistrate Fricke's Order states nothing about authorizing the subpoena that Plaintiffs asked for
 9 permission to issue and it states nothing about automatically requiring Platinum to provide
 10 documents in response to that subpoena. Magistrate Fricke's January 10, 2019 Order refers to an
 11 "exception" to the concept that "generally, a judgment creditor is allowed to inquire about the third
 12 party's knowledge concerning assets of the judgment debtor – but is not allowed to inquiry into the
 13 finances of the third party."²¹ However, Magistrate Fricke's January 10, 2019 Order does not state
 14 or otherwise hold that said exception actually applies to the third party discovery sought by Plaintiffs
 15 from Platinum. There is nothing about Plaintiffs' subpoena that is "focused narrowly on enforcing
 16 the judgment by supplemental proceedings."

17 Paragraph Four (4) of Magistrate Fricke's January 10, 2019 Order states, in relevant part,
 18 "[t]he parties shall follow the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the Western District of
 19 Washington Local Civil Rules regarding discovery, motion practice and other aspects of this
 20 matter."²² The Court's file does not reflect that Plaintiffs ever issued a subpoena for an oral
 21 deposition to Platinum or Ms. McKernan.

22
 23
 24 ¹⁸ Dkt. 5.

25 ¹⁹ Dkt. 5 (citing *Danning v. Lavine*, 572 F.2d 1386, 1390-91 (9th Cir. 1978) (emphasis added)).

26 ²⁰ Dkt. 5.

27 ²¹ Dkt 5.

28 ²² Dkt 5.

1 Apparently, on Tuesday, February 20, 2019, counsel for Plaintiffs and previous counsel for
 2 Platinum (Mr. Kessling) had a discussion about Plaintiffs' subpoena.²³ On Thursday February 21,
 3 2019, counsel for Plaintiffs wrote an email to previous counsel for Platinum addressing their
 4 conversation.²⁴ The February 21, 2019 email from counsel for Plaintiffs mentions nothing about an
 5 oral deposition of Ms. McKernan.

6 The Court file does not reflect any sort of response from Mr. Kessling confirming that
 7 counsel for Plaintiffs' recitation of the conversation was correct. However, on February 22, 2019,
 8 Mr. Kessling wrote to counsel for Plaintiffs providing Platinum's renewed objections to Plaintiffs'
 9 subpoena, providing a pleading entitled Answer to Subpoena for Documents to Platinum Collision
 10 Center, LLC dba Ace Autobody & Collision which contained further objections and citations to
 11 authority for the same. Mr. Kessling further advised that he no longer represented Platinum as of
 12 February 22, 2019.²⁵

13 Platinum further identified a speaking agent for the corporation as to the items requested in
 14 the subpoena.²⁶ Platinum's written responses to the subpoena requests and the documents produced
 15 therewith show as follows:

- 16 1. Andrew Jacobs has never been a member of Platinum;
- 17 2. Platinum is a single member LLC with Ms. McKernan as the only member; and
- 18 3. There are no silent owners or partners in Platinum.
- 19 4. There are no documents related to any joint ventures, partnerships, corporations,
 20 limited liability partnerships, or any other business entity other than a limited liability company.
- 21 5. Platinum had not yet filed any corporate tax returns.
- 22 6. Andrew Jacobs is not a signor on Platinum's bank account with Heritage Bank.
- 23 7. Andrew Jacobs was issued a form 1099-MISC for 2018.

24 ²³ Dkt. 11-11.

25 ²⁴ *Id.*

26 ²⁵ Dkt. 11-14.

27 ²⁶ *Id.*

1 On March 14, 2019, Plaintiffs filed a Motion to Compel Platinum to provide documents in
 2 response to the subpoena Plaintiffs issued and to “request an order authorizing an examination of
 3 Tausha McKernan, the sole member/owner of Ace Autobody.”²⁷ Plaintiffs’ Motion states that
 4 Plaintiffs’ counsel conferred with Platinum pursuant to Civil Rule 26 in an effort to resolve
 5 discovery disputes, but nothing in the record indicates that there was ever a discussion regarding
 6 Ms. McKernan’s oral deposition or an oral deposition of a representative of Platinum.

7 With respect to the deposition of Ms. McKernan, Plaintiffs Motion to Compel framed the
 8 issue: “Should the Court issue an Order compelling Ms. McKernan to appear for an examination so
 9 that Plaintiffs can investigate her business relationship with Mr. Jacobs under oath?”²⁸ As it applied
 10 to the oral deposition of Ms. McKernan, Plaintiffs further argued, “the Court should also enter an
 11 Order requiring Ms. McKernan to appear for an examination before this Court. Such an examination
 12 would be authorized under Rules 69 and 45.²⁹ While Plaintiffs had obtained an Order authorizing
 13 third party discovery under the Federal Rules pursuant to Rule 69, Plaintiffs had never issued a
 14 subpoena to Ms. McKernan pursuant to Rule 45 for an oral deposition. This deprived
 15 Ms. McKernan of the ability to have the required time to object to such a subpoena and/or bring a
 16 motion for protective order regarding the same.

17 Plaintiffs were aware that Platinum had no lawyer and Plaintiffs’ Motion to Compel was
 18 noted for hearing on March 29, 2019.³⁰

19 Plaintiffs’ Motion to Compel went on to argue that Plaintiffs have “put substantial evidence
 20 before the Court that raises a reasonable doubt as to the bona fides of Mr. Jacobs’ relationship with
 21 Ace Autobody. In fact, Plaintiffs have created a reasonable doubt that Ms. McKernan’s purported
 22 ownership of Ace Autobody is merely a front for Mr. Jacobs, the real owner.”³¹ Plaintiffs further
 23

24 ²⁷ Dkt. 10.

25 ²⁸ Dkt. 10 (emphasis added).

26 ²⁹ Dkt 10 (emphasis added).

³⁰ Dkt. 10.

³¹ Dkt. 10.

1 argued that there is a “reasonable suspicion that there is an improper relationship between
 2 Mr. Jacobs and Ace Autobody.”

3 On March 27, 2019, Ms. McKernan filed a pro se Declaration in Reply to Plaintiffs’ Motion
 4 to Compel attempting to state her position regarding the Motion to Compel. She is obviously not an
 5 attorney, but her Declaration did state, in relevant part:

6 1. She is the sole member of Platinum.

7 2. Her cousin Mr. Jacobs was employed as a marketing and sales manager.

8 3. She does not understand why she needs to provide trade secret information or
 9 personal, private, and confidential information to Allstate, including personal information about her
 10 employees, family relationships, and communications with her family.

11 4. She provided a letter from Platinum’s banker stating that she is the sole signatory on
 12 Platinum’s bank account.

13 5. If Plaintiffs desired to garnish Mr. Jacobs’ wages, she would “accept garnishment
 14 paperwork as well.”

15 6. She thought she would be unable to produce all the information that Allstate is asking
 16 for.

17 7. That she be allowed to appoint a speaking agent, Mr. Saghdejian, for Platinum.

18 One of the issues focused on by Plaintiffs’ in the Motion to Compel and in the Declaration in
 19 Support of the Motion to Compel, was Plaintiffs claim that “[p]laintiffs should be entitled to
 20 discover any powers of attorney to determine if Mr. Jacobs is silently controlling the assets of
 21 undisclosed business entities (which he appears to be doing).”³² This assertion was formed based on
 22 Allstate’s submission of redacted copies of three checks issued by Allstate to Platinum and other
 23 second parties whom Allstate redacted from the copies of the checks submitted. Had Allstate not
 24 redacted the other payees on the checks, Platinum would have had the ability to demonstrate to the
 25

26

³²Dkt 10.

1 Court that this is an absolutely false assertion by Allstate. Allstate used the redacted payees to create
 2 the illusion that the same were “undisclosed business entities.” Allstate’s allegations could not be
 3 further from the truth.

4 Upon review of the redacted checks and the “poa” designation on the back of the redacted
 5 checks, new counsel for Platinum quickly surmised that the situation was nothing like what Allstate
 6 was portraying. New counsel for Platinum quickly determined that Platinum operates like many
 7 other collision repair facilities that are paid by insurance companies. When the customer comes in,
 8 they sign a work order with Platinum that allows Platinum to deposit payment from the insurance
 9 company if the insurance company makes the check out to both Platinum and the customer (which
 10 insurers often do). Had Allstate disclosed the names redacted on the checks, Platinum could have
 11 easily matched the check to a customer name and pointed searched for the limited power of attorney
 12 signed by Platinum’s customer authorizing the same. Counsel for Platinum pointed this out to
 13 counsel for Allstate in written correspondence. *Morgan Declaration, Exhibit B*. Additionally,
 14 Platinum has recovered what it believes to be associated limited powers of attorney from its
 15 customers for two out of the three redacted checks submitted by Allstate in support of the Motion to
 16 Compel. *Morgan Declaration, Exhibit C*. The “power of attorney” is not some power of attorney
 17 issued by Platinum to Mr. Jacobs to “silently control” Platinum and Allstate’s redaction of the
 18 checks was done for no purpose other than to create the illusion of these “undisclosed business
 19 entities” to fool the Court.³³

20 Plaintiffs argued that the “poa” on the reverse of their redacted checks “indicates that Ace
 21 Autobody’s statement that there are now power of attorney documents is false and that Mr. Jacobs is
 22 exercising such power. And it indicates that Ace Autobody may have more than one bank or
 23

24

25 ³³ There is no other explanation for the use of the redaction in conjunction with the reference to “undisclosed business
 26 entities.” The only other possible explanation is that Allstate believes the identities of the second payees on the checks is
 sensitive information which should not be disclosed to the court or to Platinum. If that is the case, then it supports
 Platinum’s theory of the confidential nature of the information now sought by Plaintiffs.

1 financial account to deposit company revenues, funds and assets.”³⁴ There is nothing indicating that
 2 Platinum has more than one bank account and, even if it does, doing so is not a crime nor does it
 3 lead to the conclusion that Mr. Jacobs somehow is a member of Platinum.

4 Another basis for Plaintiffs’ Motion to Compel was its assertions regarding the address of
 5 Ms. McKernan listed on Platinum’s filings with the Secretary of State.³⁵ As it turns out, the address
 6 listed is a typographical error. The address listed on the documents is 5707 63rd Avenue West,
 7 University Place, Washington. Plaintiffs are correct – that is an incorrect address. Ms. McKernan
 8 actually resided at 5704 63rd Avenue West, University Place, Washington. There is nothing
 9 nefarious about typos.

10 On April 1, 2019, the Court entered an Order on Plaintiffs’ Motion to Compel.³⁶ With
 11 respect to Platinum, the Court’s order stated, in relevant part, that “Ms. McKernan’s responses to
 12 plaintiffs’ motion to compel do not identify any grounds for failing to comply with the relevant and
 13 reasonable discovery requests . . . and the subpoena to Ms. McKernan.”³⁷ That was incorrect.
 14 Ms. McKernan’s objections to the subpoena requests were decently stated in the answers provided
 15 by Mr. Kessling. It appears that Magistrate Fricke was only focused on Ms. McKernan’s pro se
 16 declaration.

17 Magistrate Fricke further held, “Plaintiffs have presented evidence sufficient ‘to raise a
 18 reasonable doubt about the bona fides of [any] transfer of assets between’ Mr. Jacobs and
 19 Ms. McKernan.”³⁸ The Court’s order required Platinum to provide responses to Plaintiffs’ document
 20 subpoena by April 10, 2019, and further required Ms. McKernan to appear for an examination on

22 ³⁴ Dkt. 10.

23 ³⁵ Dkt 10 at page 14.

24 ³⁶ Dkt. 19.

25 ³⁷ *Id.* Notably, the only grant of authority by Magistrate Fricke was to allow Plaintiffs to conduct third party discovery to
 26 Platinum. There was no grant of authority to allow third party discovery directly to Ms. McKernan. However, instead of
 directing its subpoena to Platinum only, Plaintiffs overreached and included a very broad definition of the term “YOU”
 in the subpoena which included not just Platinum, but all of Platinum’s employees, attorneys, agents, consultants,
 representatives, and anyone else acting or who has acted for or on its behalf.

³⁸ *Id.* (citing *Credit Lyonnais, S.A. v. SGC Int’l, Inc.*, 160 F.3d 428, 431 (8th Cir. 1998)).

1 April 17, 2019.³⁹ There is no indication in the Court's file as to whether Platinum or Ms. McKernan
 2 was ever served with the April 1, 2019 Order or the method of service. Platinum disagrees that
 3 Plaintiffs presented any such evidence when, in the very short time that counsel for Platinum has
 4 been on board, Platinum has devastated the main theory of Plaintiffs. Platinum anticipates that given
 5 a reasonable amount of time to put the remainder of Allstate's theories to appropriate testing, they
 6 too will be debunked.

7 Platinum makes its objections to Magistrate Fricke's April 1, 2019 Order above and requests
 8 that the District Court consider those objections and modify the April 1, 2019 Order and set it aside
 9 as set forth on pages 1-2 of these objections.

10 **III. EVIDENCE RELIED UPON**

11 Platinum relies on the records and files herein and the Declaration of Stuart C. Morgan in
 12 support of this Motion and the exhibits attached thereto.

13 **IV. ADDITIONAL ARGUMENT**

14 The district court judge who assigned the case retains ultimate authority over the case and
 15 shall modify or set aside any portion of the magistrate judge's order found to be clearly erroneous or
 16 contrary to law.⁴⁰ Even if no objections are filed, the District Court has the authority to rehear or
 17 reconsider the matter *sua sponte*.⁴¹ If the District Court is not inclined to grant Platinum's objections
 18 herein, Platinum should be at least afforded the opportunity now that it is not acting pro se to have a
 19 full hearing on the merits of Plaintiffs' Motion to Compel so as much evidence as possible may be
 20 heard by the Court.

21 Allstate never issued a writ of garnishment, a writ of attachment, or a writ of execution to
 22 Platinum to enforce its judgment against Mr. Jacobs. Platinum terminated Mr. Jacobs on April 3,
 23 2019. Platinum no longer employs Mr. Jacobs (yet the business still manages to operate). Platinum
 24

25 ³⁹ *Id.*

26 ⁴⁰ *Moore v. Ford Motor Co.*, 755 F.3d 802 (5th Cir. 2014).

⁴¹ *Baker-McKee Janssen Corr, Federal Civil Rules Handbook* at 1330 (2017).

1 does not have any property of Mr. Jacobs in its possession. Platinum is not indebted to nor would it
 2 become indebted to Mr. Jacobs at any time.

3 Plaintiffs' main theory that Mr. Jacobs is a "silent owner" is belied by the corporate
 4 documents which name only Ms. McKernan as the sole member. There is nothing nefarious about
 5 Ms. McKernan employing other individuals to conduct the day-to-day operations of the company.
 6 Ms. McKernan stated in her Declaration she was willing to accept garnishment paperwork regarding
 7 Mr. Jacobs. Plaintiffs never issued a writ of garnishment yet Plaintiffs want Platinum to turn over
 8 every single financial document about the company to them. Plaintiffs' theory that Mr. Jacobs
 9 operates the company pursuant to a power of attorney has been completely wiped out in spite of
 10 Plaintiffs' attempts to hide behind a redaction of checks.

11 Although Plaintiffs had the ability to do so, Plaintiffs never issued a subpoena to
 12 Ms. McKernan for an oral deposition. The Court never acquired jurisdiction over her to force her to
 13 be deposed and she never had the ability to object to such a subpoena or seek a protective order
 14 regarding the same.

15 Platinum does not dispute that Plaintiffs have a judgment against Mr. Jacobs. However,
 16 Platinum also has the right to continue to operate its business without the entirety of its existence
 17 being soaked up by the wild-west and factually unsupported discovery tactics of Plaintiffs.

18 DATED this 10th day of April 2019.

19 LEDGER SQUARE LAW, P.S.

20 By: s/ Stuart C. Morgan

21 Stuart C. Morgan, WSBA # 26368

22 Grady R. Heins, WSBA # 54262

23 Ledger Square Law, P.S.

24 710 Market St.

25 Tacoma, WA 98402

26 Phone: (253) 327-1900

Phone: (253) 327-1700

Email: stu@ledgersquarelaw.com

grady@ledgersquarelaw.com

Attorneys for Platinum Collision Center LLC

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned certifies under the penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of Washington that I am now and at all times herein mentioned a resident of the State of Washington, over the age of eighteen years, not a party to or interested in the above-entitled action, and competent to be a witness herein.

On the date given below, I caused to be served the foregoing document on the following persons and in the manner listed below:

Mark B. Melter
Fain Anderson Vanderhoef Rosendahl
701 Fifth Ave., Suite 4750
Seattle, WA 98104-7089

- CM/ECF
- Via Legal Messenger
- Overnight Courier
- Electronically via email
- Facsimile

DATED this 10th day of April 2019 at Tacoma, Washington.

s/ Amy Jean Shackelford, PP, PLS
Legal Assistant to Stuart C. Morgan and
Grady R. Heins
Ledger Square Law, P.S.
710 Market St.
Tacoma, WA 98402
Phone: (253) 327-1900
Facsimile: (253) 327-1700